Read critically: build a claim and evidence map for one book passage

Worked example

The following study-club scenario is original teaching material, not a real experiment or a quotation from a book. Eight volunteers do similar tasks for 25 minutes. Four choose to close their messenger; four keep it available. The first group completes an average of six tasks per person, the second four. The organiser concludes that turning off messages makes everyone learn better.

The table separates the reported observation from the extra steps in the reasoning. The numbers do not establish accuracy, understanding or later recall.

A complete map of an invented example

Part	What the example gives us	What still needs checking
Observation	Group averages of six and four completed tasks	Accuracy and comparable difficulty are unspecified
Causal inference	Closing messages caused the difference	Volunteers chose their groups; other differences remain
General conclusion	Everyone learns better without messages	Eight volunteers and a task count cannot establish that
Implicit assumption	More completed tasks means better learning	Understanding and later recall were not measured
Bounded verdict	Different task counts in one fictional session	Cause and wider applicability remain open

Source and edition: The Open University / OpenLearn: Sharpening Your Critical Thinking

Read critically: build a claim and evidence map for one book passage

Your notes

Fill the blank fields with your own records.

Name / project

Source and edition

Page / location

Question

Claim, reasons and limits

Part	What the example gives us	What still needs checking
Observation		
Causal inference		
General conclusion		
Implicit assumption		
Bounded verdict		

My summary / judgement

My next action

Date

Actual result / open question